

**MODELLING ECONOMIC
DEVELOPMENT POLICY:
ECONOMETRIC,
GENERAL EQUILIBRIUM,
AND AGENT-BASED PERSPECTIVES**

A Thesis Submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)

BRETT W. PARRIS

**BSc, BTh (Hons), MA (Development Studies)
GradDipEcSt, PostgradDipEc**

DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMETRICS AND BUSINESS STATISTICS

MONASH UNIVERSITY

AUSTRALIA

OCTOBER 2006

CONTENTS

ABSTRACT.....	XI
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	XV
ACRONYMS.....	XVII
PUBLICATIONS AND PRESENTATIONS.....	XVIII
1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
2. THE ROOTS OF DEVELOPMENT – WHERE DID THE WEALTH OF THE RICH COUNTRIES COME FROM?.....	13
2.1 INTRODUCTION.....	13
2.2 WHERE HAVE WE COME FROM?.....	15
2.3 DID THE WEST GET RICH BY EXPLOITING THE THIRD WORLD?.....	19
2.4 THE RISE OF THE WEST.....	21
2.4.1 Early Beginnings.....	21
2.4.2 The ‘Industrial Revolution’.....	23
2.4.3 Health & Disease.....	26
2.4.4 Migration.....	27
2.5 THE DRIVERS OF WEALTH CREATION.....	28
2.5.1 Specialisation and Mass Production.....	28
2.5.2 Entrepreneurship, ‘New Combinations’ and Finance.....	30
2.5.3 Diversification and Technological Deepening.....	47
2.6 A PREREQUISITE FOR WEALTH CREATION: SOUND INSTITUTIONS.....	53
2.7 THE BEDROCK OF DEVELOPMENT: HUMAN CAPABILITIES.....	58
2.8 CONCLUSIONS.....	59
3. METHODOLOGICAL DILEMMAS IN MODELLING ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT.....	62
3.1 INTRODUCTION.....	62
3.2 MATHEMATICAL MODELLING IN ECONOMICS.....	62
3.2.1 Caveat 1: Mathematical Formalism Can Become an End in Itself.....	64
3.2.2 Caveat 2: Mathematics Can Be a Form of Linguistic Determinism.....	64
3.2.3 Caveat 3: The Type of Mathematics Used Determines the Results.....	70
3.2.4 Caveat 4: The Mathematics of Complex Systems is not Simple.....	76
3.3 TWO APPROACHES TO ECONOMIC MODELLING.....	78
3.3.1 Top-Down Modelling.....	78
3.3.2 Bottom-Up Modelling.....	83
3.3.3 Why Does the Modelling Framework Matter? The Language of ‘Market Failure’ and its Influence on Policy.....	89
3.4 COMPLEX SYSTEMS THEORY AND ECONOMICS.....	94
3.4.1 Resultant versus Emergent Phenomena.....	95
3.4.2 Microreductionism versus Synthetic Microanalysis.....	97
3.4.3 Statistical Mechanics, Situated Individual Models and Economics.....	100
3.5 BOTTOM-UP APPROACHES TO ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT.....	115
3.6 DO A MODEL’S ASSUMPTIONS NEED TO BE REALISTIC?.....	117

3.6.1 Assumptions Should Not Misrepresent Agents' Behaviours	119
3.6.2 Assumptions Must be Mathematically Appropriate to the Domain.....	121
3.6.3 There are Different Kinds of Assumptions	125
3.6.4 Sensitivity to Initial Conditions and Gödel Incompleteness May Make Accurate Prediction Impossible.....	128
3.6.5 Predictions Often Cannot Be Verified.....	130
3.6.6 Models are Used for Policy Evaluation not just Prediction	132
3.6.7 Conclusion: Assumptions Do Matter	133
3.7 DO ABSTRACT MODELS BRING 'INSIGHT' OR TELL STORIES?	135
3.8 THE EMPIRICS OF ECONOMIC GROWTH AND 'OPENNESS'	138
3.9 CONCLUSIONS	142
4. EXPORTS, GROWTH AND POVERTY.....	145
4.1 COMMODITY PRICE VOLATILITY AND TERMS OF TRADE TRENDS	145
4.2 PANEL DATA REGRESSIONS.....	155
4.2.1 Fixed Effects and Random Effects Panel Data Models	157
4.2.2 The Breusch-Pagan Test.....	159
4.2.3 The Hausman Test.....	160
4.2.4 Autocorrelation.....	161
4.3 REGRESSION RESULTS	162
4.3.1 Introduction and Overview.....	162
4.3.2 Export Concentration	165
4.3.3 Terms of Trade Volatility.....	167
4.3.4 Purchasing Power of Exports Volatility.....	169
4.3.5 Types of Exports	170
4.4 CONCLUSIONS	177
5. MODELLING INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT AID	179
5.1 'TRADE NOT AID'?.....	179
5.1.1 Infrastructure	183
5.1.2 Aid for Human Capabilities	184
5.1.3 Aid for Institutions	186
5.1.4 Conclusion: Poor Countries Do Not Have Enough Money to Trade their Way to Prosperity.....	188
5.2 AID ONLY FOR COUNTRIES WITH 'GOOD' POLICIES?	190
5.3 TWO FUNDAMENTAL ROLES FOR AID.....	201
5.3.1 Ensuring Children Thrive.....	201
5.3.2 Making Markets Work for the Poor	202
5.4 CONCLUSIONS ON MODELLING AID EFFECTIVENESS.....	207
6. GENERAL EQUILIBRIUM MODELLING PERSPECTIVES ON ECONOMIC RESILIENCE USING GTAP	209
6.1 INTRODUCTION TO THE GTAP MODEL.....	209
6.2 NETWORKS AND INDUSTRIAL STRUCTURE	210
6.3 SIMULATION 1: LIBERALISATION, CONCENTRATION AND WELFARE.....	212
6.4 SIMULATION 2: TECHNOLOGICAL SHOCKS	222
6.5 VISUALISING ECONOMIC NETWORK INDUSTRIAL STRUCTURES	240
6.6 CONCLUSIONS	245

7. LIMITATIONS OF GENERAL-EQUILIBRIUM ANALYSIS	249
7.1 INTRODUCTION	249
7.2 STRENGTHS OF COMPUTABLE GENERAL-EQUILIBRIUM MODELS.....	250
7.3 THE SONNENSCHNEIN-MANTEL-DEBREU RESULTS.....	253
7.4 THE REPRESENTATIVE AGENT	257
7.4.1 Problems with Representative Agents	257
7.4.2 Attempts to Overcome Representative Agent Problems in CGE Modelling	261
7.5 CAPITAL AND AGGREGATE PRODUCTION FUNCTIONS.....	265
7.5.1 Capital Controversies and Production	266
7.5.2 Why Do Production Functions Seem to ‘Work’ Empirically?	269
7.6 ECONOMIC DYNAMICS AND THE NOTION OF ‘EQUILIBRIUM’	276
7.6.1 Definitions of Equilibrium.....	276
7.6.2 Confusing the Two Notions of Equilibrium	287
7.6.3 Arriving at Equilibrium, <i>Tâtonnement</i> and Stability Analysis	289
7.6.4 Equilibrium and the Method of Comparative Statics	298
7.6.5 The Reversibility of Equilibrium Equations	303
7.6.6 The Computability of Equilibria.....	304
7.6.7 Is Equilibrium Economic Dynamics Even Theoretically Possible?	306
7.6.8 Is Equilibrium a Useful Framework for Modelling Economies?.....	308
7.7 IMPERFECT INFORMATION AND UNCERTAINTY	314
7.7.1 Imperfect Information.....	314
7.7.2 Uncertainty.....	316
7.8 INCOMPLETE MARKETS AND CONTRACTS.....	322
7.9 THE BREADTH AND EVOLUTION OF PREFERENCES.....	325
7.10 THE RATIONALITY AND COMPUTATIONAL CAPACITIES OF AGENTS.....	328
7.11 INCREASING RETURNS AND PATH DEPENDENCY.....	334
7.12 CONCLUSIONS ON CGE MODELS	337
8. AGENT-BASED APPROACHES TO DEVELOPMENT MODELLING	345
8.1 AN INTRODUCTION TO AGENT-BASED MODELS.....	345
8.2 AGENT-BASED SIMULATION AND ECONOMIC THEORY	352
8.3 VERIFICATION AND VALIDATION OF ABMS.....	356
8.4 COMPUTATIONAL CHALLENGES.....	359
8.4.1 Greater Computer Power	360
8.4.2 Linking ABMs and Equation-Based Models.....	361
8.5 USING ABMS FOR DEVELOPMENT POLICY	368
8.5.1 Ethnic Tension and Development.....	369
8.5.2 Managing Industrial Policy.....	371
8.5.3 Wealth Creation and A Bargaining Theory of Value	373
8.5.3 (a) The Identification of Price with Value	377
8.5.3 (b) The Bargaining Process.....	382
8.6 CONCLUSIONS.....	387
9. FOUNDATIONS OF AN AGENT-BASED MODEL	389
9.1 INTRODUCTION	389
9.2 AN AGENT-BASED BARGAINING APPROACH TO VALUE AND DISTRIBUTION ..	389
9.2.1 What Determines Bargaining Power?.....	389
9.2.2 The Purpose of the Model.....	393
9.2.3 Deciding on the Aggregates.....	394

9.3 AN ABM OF TANZANIA	399
9.3.1 Overview of the ABM.....	399
9.3.2 The DevModel Class.....	401
9.3.3 The DevSpace Class.....	413
9.3.4 The DevAgent Class.....	417
9.3.5 The Person Class	417
9.3.6 The Household Class.....	418
9.3.7 The Other Classes.....	420
9.4 THE BARGAINING PROCESS	421
9.5 DEMOGRAPHIC EVOLUTION.....	426
9.6 CONCLUSIONS	427
10. CONCLUSIONS	428
10.1 General Conclusions	428
10.2 Reflections on the Success of CGE Models and Prospects for Policy- Oriented ABMs	433
10.3 Economists as Physicists or Civil Engineers?.....	435
REFERENCES	437
APPENDIX 1: CHAPTER 4 REGRESSION RESULTS	504
INTRODUCTORY NOTES	504
A1.1 TERMS OF TRADE VOLATILITY	507
A1.2 CHANGE IN THE TERMS OF TRADE.....	508
A1.3 VOLATILITY OF THE PURCHASING POWER OF EXPORTS.....	509
A1.4 GDP PER CAPITA GROWTH.....	510
A1.4 GDP PER CAPITA GROWTH (CONT.).....	511
A1.5 INFANT MORTALITY	512
A1.6 UNDER-5 MORTALITY	513
A1.7 IMMUNISATION AGAINST MEASLES	514
A1.8 IMMUNISATION AGAINST DIPHTHERIA, PERTUSSIS (WHOOPING COUGH) AND TETANUS	515
A1.9 FEMALE LIFE EXPECTANCY AT BIRTH.....	516
A1.10 FEMALE ADULT ILLITERACY	517
A1.11: FEMALE YOUTH ILLITERACY.....	518
A1.12 MALNUTRITION PREVALENCE AMONG CHILDREN UNDER 5, HEIGHT FOR AGE	519
A1.13: MALNUTRITION PREVALENCE AMONG CHILDREN UNDER 5, WEIGHT FOR AGE	520
A1.14 LOW BIRTH-WEIGHT BABIES	521
APPENDIX 2: COUNTRY LIST AND TIME PERIODS FOR CHAPTER 4 REGRESSIONS	522
APPENDIX 3: VARIABLE DEFINITIONS AND DATA SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 4.....	523
APPENDIX 4: OFFICIAL DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE PER CAPITA IN 2004	537

APPENDIX 5: VARIABLE DEFINITIONS AND DATA SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 5	538
APPENDIX 6: COUNTRY LIST AND TIME PERIODS FOR CHAPTER 5 REGRESSIONS.....	542
APPENDIX 7: TABLES 6.2 & 6.3 WITHOUT VIETNAM	543
APPENDIX 8: GTAP COMMODITY CODES	545
APPENDIX 9: TANZANIAN SAM & ABM CODES	546

TABLES

Table 2.1: World Population, GDP and GDP per capita.....	15
Table 2.2: Life expectancy at birth, 1820-1999	18
Table 2.3: Composition and growth of the global financial stock 1980-2010.....	41
Table 2.4: Average annual research and development indicators for 1996-2000	51
Table 3.1: The solvability of mathematical models	77
Table 4.1: Instability indices and trends in monthly market prices.....	147
Table 4.2: Extreme examples of export concentration and diversification (EXCONC)	154
Table 4.3: Summary of regression results for export concentration	166
Table 4.4: Summary of descriptive statistics for percentage changes between periods for key variables.....	167
Table 4.5: Summary of regression results for terms of trade volatility.....	167
Table 4.6: Summary of results for purchasing power of exports volatility.....	170
Table 4.7: Summary of regression results for export category shares	171
Table 5.1: Burnside and Dollar’s (B&D) growth regression to derive their ‘policy’ variable.....	193
Table 5.2: Growth regression similar to Burnside and Dollar’s using World Bank data	195
Table 5.3: The poor pay more for basic services	205
Table 6.1: Concentrations and results from liberalisation simulations	215
Table 6.2: Ordinary least squares regression results for percentage change in GDP following the initial liberalisation	219
Table 6.3: Ordinary least squares regression results for change in welfare as a percentage of initial GDP following liberalisation	221
Table 6.4: Summary statistics for technology shock results in Tables 6.5 and 6.6..	223

Table 6.5: Results of the 10% shock to output augmenting technical change (aoall) in the rest of the world’s production of countries’ lead export – for Non-Liberalised versions	224
Table 6.6: Results of the 10% shock to output augmenting technical change (aoall) in the rest of the world’s production of countries’ lead export – for Liberalised versions	226
Table 6.7: Comparison of post-shock welfare effects due to terms of trade (TOT) changes for Liberalised and Non-Liberalised versions, sorted by difference	228
Table 6.8: Comparison of post-shock total welfare changes for Liberalised and Non-Liberalised versions, sorted by difference	230
Table 6.9: Regression results for welfare changes following the 10% output-augmenting technical change shock for both Non-Liberalised and Liberalised versions	234
Table 6.10: Fraction of economies’ lead export industries’ total costs due to own-industry inputs prior to the rest of the world’s technological improvement shock (sorted from highest fraction to lowest).....	235
Table 6.11: Summary statistics of the differences in outcomes for Non-Liberalised and Liberalised economies for welfare and terms of trade, for main export sectors	238

FIGURES

Figure 2.1: World population 1-2001	16
Figure 2.2: World real GDP 1-2001	16
Figure 2.3: World real per capita GDP 1-2001	16
Figure 2.4: Life expectancy at birth 1820-1999	18
Figure 2.5: Real GDP per capita 1-1820	22
Figure 2.6: Real GDP per capita 1820-2000	23
Figure 2.7: Composition and growth of the global financial stock 1980-2010.....	41
Figure 3.1: The traditional top-down approach to economic modelling.....	79
Figure 3.2: An alternative bottom-up approach to modelling.....	87
Figure 3.3: The microreductionist approach to system analysis	98
Figure 3.4: The synthetic microanalytic approach to system analysis.....	99
Figure 3.5: The process of approximation in situated-individual models.....	103
Figure 3.6: A system suitable for modelling by statistical mechanics	106
Figure 3.7: A system not suitable for modelling by statistical mechanics?	108
Figure 4.1: Price indices for certain commodities, 1960-2005	145
Figure 4.2: Incidence of extreme poverty (\$1 per day poverty line) in LDCs according to export specialisation: 1981-83, 1987-89 & 1997-99.....	149
Figure 4.3: Incidence of poverty (\$2 per day poverty line) in LDCs according to export specialisation: 1981-83, 1987-89 & 1997-99	149
Figure 4.4: Log of commodity terms of trade, 1900-1998.....	152
Figure 4.5: Purchasing power of exports for seven countries over time.....	154
Figure 4.6: Agricultural raw materials prices.....	173
Figure 4.7: Indexes for developed country manufactured exports and all ores and metals	175
Figure 5.1 Australia's ODA/GNI Ratio, 1971-2007	180
Figure 5.2 Australia's Real GNI and ODA per capita 1971-2007	180

Figure 6.1: Change in export concentration following liberalisation vs change in welfare as a percentage of GDP.....	214
Figure 6.2: Change in export concentration following liberalisation vs percentage change in original GDP	216
Figure 6.3: Change in welfare as a percentage of original GDP following liberalisation	217
Figure 6.4: Initial protection versus change in GDP following liberalisation	218
Figure 6.5: Initial protection versus change in welfare following liberalisation	218
Figure 6.6: Lowess Plot for Non-Liberalised economies of the change in welfare as a percentage of GDP following the 10% technical change shock against the degree of export concentration existing prior to the shock.....	232
Figure 6.7: Lowess plot for Non-Liberalised economies of the change in welfare as a percentage of GDP after the 10% technical change shock against the fraction of total costs of the main export industry accounted for by own-commodity inputs prior to the shock	233
Figure 6.8: Lowess plot for Non-Liberalised economies prior to the shock of export concentration against GDP per capita.....	239
Figure 6.9: Lowess plot for Non-Liberalised economies prior to the shock of output concentration against GDP per capita.....	239
Figure 6.10: Square matrix structure of domestic industry inputs.....	241
Figure 6.11: Comparison of the input network structures of Tanzania and Vietnam	242
Figure 6.12: Matrix structure of domestic industry outputs.....	243
Figure 6.13: Comparison of the output network structures of Tanzania and Vietnam (Non-liberalised versions)	244
Figure 7.1: Horridge and Ferreira Filho’s triple-decker model of Brazil	263
Figure 7.2: Relationship between B-Equilibrium and S-Equilibrium.....	285
Figure 8.1: Using separate CGE and ABM models to analyse policy questions.....	364
Figure 8.2: Feeding ABM results to a CGE model.....	364
Figure 8.3: Feeding CGE results to an ABM.....	365
Figure 8.4: Incorporating an ABM into a dynamic CGE model.....	365
Figure 8.5: Incorporating a dynamic CGE model into an ABM.....	367

Figure 8.6: Two primary channels of wealth creation.....	374
Figure 9.1: Schematic of the interaction between economies of scale, market structure and bargaining power	390
Figure 9.2: A conceptual map of the determination of bargaining power	392
Figure 9.3: What is lost at each successively higher level of aggregation?	396
Figure 9.4: Basic UML class diagram.....	400
Figure 9.5: Class structure of the agent-based model	401
Figure 9.6: UML class diagram of the DevModel class.....	403
Figure 9.7: Screen-shot of the representative region landscape.....	415
Figure 9.8: UML class diagram of the DevSpace class	416
Figure 9.9: UML class diagram of the DevAgent class	417
Figure 9.10: UML class diagram of the Person class.....	418
Figure 9.11: UML class diagram of the Household class	419
Figure 9.12: Screen-shots of the bargaining power of rural households.....	426
Figure 9.13: Comparison of population evolution: ABM vs Actual Data	426

ABSTRACT

Global poverty and the complexities of economic development pose significant challenges for the discipline of economics. This thesis explores the extent to which different types of economic models are capable of meeting those challenges. It begins with an historical overview of development, arguing that only by understanding its critical processes can we begin to gauge what should be included in development policy models today. The recognition that economies are complex evolutionary systems has also prompted a range of methodological questions which are discussed in the next chapter. It is argued that the assumptions underlying economic models matter, and that we should not choose a modelling framework or levels of aggregation before we have understood the nature of the complex system we are trying to model. Starting with a closed-form analytic mathematical framework immediately constrains what questions can be addressed.

Trade and industrial policy and aid effectiveness are discussed more explicitly in the next three chapters. Cross-country regressions confirm that there does seem to be a statistical correlation between countries' export and output concentrations and their economic vulnerability. Cross-country regressions are also criticised however, when they are pushed beyond their sensible limits, as in recent controversies over the benefits of 'openness' and aid effectiveness. A discussion of some of the most important roles for aid suggests that many important considerations for modelling aid effectiveness are difficult or impossible to incorporate with current analytic approaches. An econometric analysis of multiple computable general equilibrium (CGE) simulations using a standard neoclassical framework in the next chapter moreover also suggests that not all countries benefit from liberalisation. These results reinforce the need for a dynamic evolutionary framework in which the possible trade-offs between allocative-efficiency and stability-efficiency can be examined.

One of the open secrets in economics is just how strongly so much of the economic theory used for policy analysis has been criticised from within the profession. A number of these criticisms are drawn together to try to infer their cumulative implications for CGE modelling. In my view, they suggest that CGE models are

likely to be of limited value in modelling medium- to long-term economic development policies. Another approach is called for.

One approach has emerged in recent years that offers the potential to simultaneously address many of the limitations of standard general equilibrium modelling. Agent-based models adopt an evolutionary computational framework in which discrete agents decide their actions independently, based on their attributes, behaviours, learning capacities and interactions with each other and their environment. Agent-based modelling offers the potential to revolutionise economic modelling, drawing strongly on econometric and statistical analysis, and permitting full integration with the political, social, institutional, geographic and environmental dimensions of development. It is ideal, for example for analysing the interactions between economic growth and ethnic tension, the circumstances under which industrial policies could work, and the bargaining processes by which value is enumerated and wealth is distributed. Some foundations for an agent-based model of Tanzania are developed in the final chapter, to illustrate some of the possibilities, before concluding.