MODELLING DUST



Daniel Price, Guillaume Laibe

Mind the Gap, Cambridge, 8th-12th July 2013



DUST BLOCKS



DUST BLOCKS (ABOVE THE GAP)



DUST GLOWS



DUST IS KEY TO STAR FORMATION



Pillars of Creation (the Eagle Nebula)

DUST EVAPORATES



DUST GROWS TO FORM PLANETS





en.wikipedia.org



Image: Gemini Observatory/AURA Artwork by Lynette Cook

MODELLING DUST+GAS

SPH gas+dust particles: Monaghan & Kocharyan (1995), Monaghan (1997), Maddison et al. (2003), Rice et al. (2004), Barriere-Fouchet et al. (2005), Ayliffe et al. (2011), Cha & Nayakshin (2011), Nayakshin & Cha (2012)...
Grid+dust particles: Fromang & Papaloizou (2006), Pardekooper & Mellema (2006), Johansen et al. (2007), Miniati (2010), Bai & Stone (2010)...

Two fluids coupled by a drag term

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \rho_{\rm g}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\rho_{\rm g} \mathbf{v}_{\rm g}) &= 0, \\ \frac{\partial \rho_{\rm d}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\rho_{\rm d} \mathbf{v}_{\rm d}) &= 0, \\ \frac{\partial \mathbf{v}_{\rm g}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{v}_{\rm g} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{v}_{\rm g} &= -\frac{\nabla P_{\rm g}}{\rho_{\rm g}} + K(\mathbf{v}_{\rm d} - \mathbf{v}_{\rm g}) + \mathbf{f}, \\ \frac{\partial \mathbf{v}_{\rm d}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{v}_{\rm d} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{v}_{\rm d} &= -K(\mathbf{v}_{\rm d} - \mathbf{v}_{\rm g}) + \mathbf{f}, \end{aligned}$$

DUSTYBOX

 Drag induces decay of differential velocity between fluids



Laibe & Price (2011, 2012a)

DUSTYWAVES

Laibe & Price, 2011, MNRAS 418, 1491

$$\delta v = A e^{i(kx - \omega t)}$$

Dispersion relation: $\omega^{3} + iK \left(\frac{1}{\hat{\rho}_{g}} + \frac{1}{\hat{\rho}_{d}}\right) \omega^{2} - k^{2}c_{s}^{2}\omega - iK\frac{k^{2}c_{s}^{2}}{\hat{\rho}_{d}} = 0$ For strong drag:

$$\omega = \pm k\tilde{c}_{\rm s} - i\frac{\hat{\rho}_{\rm g}\hat{\rho}_{\rm d}}{K\left(\hat{\rho}_{\rm g} + \hat{\rho}_{\rm d}\right)}k^2c_{\rm s}^2\left(\frac{1-A^2}{2}\right)$$

Effective sound speed:

$$\tilde{c}_{s} \equiv c_{s}A = c_{s}\left(1 + \frac{\hat{\rho}_{d}}{\hat{\rho}_{g}}\right)^{-\frac{1}{2}}$$



DUSTYWAVES: ANALYTIC SOLUTION

Laibe & Price, 2011, MNRAS 418, 1491

!DUST VELOCITIES

vd3r = - (rhogeq*cs**2*k**2*w2r**2*w1r**2*rhogsol + rhogeq**2*w3i**4*k*w1r*vgsol - w3i*cs**2*k**3*rhogeq*Kdrag*vdsol*w2r - w3i*cs**2*k**3*rhogeq*Kdrag*vdsol*w2r + w $w3i^{c}s^{*2}k^{*3}rhogeq^{*}Cdrag^{*}ysol^{*}rhogeq^{*2}cs^{**2}k^{*3}w2i^{*}2^{*}w1r^{*}ysol^{+}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{*}4^{*}w2r^{*}w1r^{*}rhogsol^{-}rhogeq^{*2}cs^{**2}k^{**3}w2r^{*}w1r^{*}ysol^{-}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{**3}w2r^{*}w1r^{*}ysol^{-}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{**}dr^{*}w1r^{*}ysol^{-}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{**}dr^{*}w1r^{*}ysol^{-}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{**}dr^{*}w1r^{*}ysol^{-}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{**}dr^{*}w1r^{*}ysol^{-}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{**}dr^{*}w1r^{*}ysol^{-}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{**}dr^{*}w1r^{*}ysol^{-}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{*}dr^{*}w1r^{*}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{*}dr^{*}w1r^{*}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{*}dr^{*}w1r^{*}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{*}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{*}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{*}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{*}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{*}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{*}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}k^{*}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}rhogeq^{*cs^{*}2}rhogeq^{*cs^{*$ $rhogeq^{*2*cs^{*2}k^{*3}w2r^{*}w1i^{*2}vgsol - rhogeq^{*cs^{*2}k^{*3}w2r^{*}w1i^{*}Kdrag^{*}vdsol - rhogeq^{*2*cs^{*2}k^{**3}w2r^{*}w1r^{*2}vgsol - rhogeq^{*w3i^{*}4}cs^{*2}rhogsol - rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{**4}w2i^{*}w1i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{*}k^{*}w2i^{*}w1i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{*}k^{*}w2i^{*}w1i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{*}k^{*}w2i^{*}w1i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{*}k^{*}w2i^{*}w1i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{*}k^{*}w2i^{*}w1i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{*}w2i^{*}w1i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{*}w2i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{*}w2i^{*}w1i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{*}w2i^{*}w1i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*cs^{*}4}k^{*}w2i^{*}$ $rhogeq^*cs^{**2}k^{**2}w1i^{**2}w2r^{**2}rhogsol + rhogeq^{**2}w3i^{**4}w2r^{*}k^{*}vgsol - rhogeq^{*}w3i^{**3}k^{*}Kdrag^{*}vdsol^{*}w1r + 2^{*}rhogeq^{*}w3i^{**3}k^{*}Kdrag^{*}vdsol^{*}w1r + 2^{*}rhogeq^{*}w2i^{**2}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}w2i^{**2}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}w2i^{**2}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}w2i^{**3}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}w2i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}w2i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}w2i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}w2i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}w2i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}w2i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}w2i^{*}rhogsol + rhogeq^{*}rhogsol + rhoge$ $rhogeq^*w2i^*2^*w1r^*2^*cs^*2^*k^*2^*rhogsol - rhogeq^*w3i^*4^*w2r^*w1r^*rhogsol + rhogeq^*w3i^*4^*w1i^*rhogsol^*w2i + w3i^*cs^*4^*k^*4^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*w2i + w3i^*cs^*4^*k^*4^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*w1i + w3i^*2^*Kdrag^*2^*k^*ysol^*w1r^*rhogsol^*w2i + w3i^*cs^*4^*k^*4^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*w2i + w3i^*cs^*4^*k^*4^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*w2i + w3i^*cs^*4^*k^*4^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*w2i + w3i^*cs^*4^*k^*a^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*w2i + w3i^*cs^*4^*k^*a^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*w2i + w3i^*cs^*a^*k^*a^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*w2i + w3i^*cs^*a^*k^*a^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*wai + w3i^*cs^*a^*k^*a^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*wai + w3i^*cs^*a^*k^*a^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*wai + w3i^*cs^*a^*k^*a^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*wai + w3i^*cs^*a^*k^*a^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*wai + w3i^*cs^*a^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*wai + w3i^*cs^*a^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*wai + w3i^*cs^*a^*rhogeq^*rhogsol^*wai + wai +$ w3i**3*Kdrag*rhogsol*k**2*cs**2 - w3i**3*Kdrag*rhogsol*w2r*w1r + w3i**3*Kdrag*rhogsol*w2i*w1i - w3i*cs**2*k**2*rhogeq*rhogsol*w2r**2*w1i - w3i*cs**2*k**2*rhogeq*rhogsol*w2r*w1i - w3i*cs**2*k**2*rhogeq*rhogsol*w2r**2*k**2*rhogeq*rhogsol*w2r**2*w1i - w3i*cs**2*k**2*rhogeq*rhogsol*w2r**2*w1i - w3i*cs**2*k**2*rhogeq*rhogsol*w2r**2*w1i - w3i*cs**2*k**2*rhogeq*rhogsol*w2r**2*w1i - w3i*cs**2*k**2*rhogeq*rhogsol*w2r**2*w1i - w3i*cs**2*k**2*rhogeq*rhogsol*w2r**2*k**2*rhogeq*rhogsol* rhogeq*w3i**3*rhogsol*k**2*cs**2*w2i + rhogeq*w3i**3*rhogsol*k**2*cs**2*w1i - rhogeq*w3i**3*rhogsol*w2r**2*w1i - rhogeq*w3i**3*rhogsol*k**2*cs**2*w1i - rhogeq*w3i**3*rhogsol*w2r**2*w1i - rhogeq*w3i**3*rhogsol*k**2*cs**2*w1i - rhogeq*w3i**3*rhogsol*k*** $w3i^{cs^{*2}}k^{*2} rhogeq^{rhogsol^{*}w2i^{*}} - w3i^{cs^{*2}}k^{*2} rhogeq^{rhogsol^{*}w2i^{*}} - rhogeq^{*}w3i^{*3} rhogsol^{*}w2i^{*} - rhogeq^{*}w3i^{*3} rhogsol^{*}w2i^{*} + 2^{rhogeq^{*}w3i^{*3}}k^{*} Kdrag^{*}vdsol^{*}w2i^{*} + 2^{rhogeq^{*}w3i^{*3}}k^{*} Kdrag^{*}vdsol^{*}w1i^{*} - rhogeq^{*}w3i^{*} + 2^{rhogeq^{*}w3i^{*}} + 2^{r$ $w3r*rhogeq*2^*cs**2^*k**3^*w2i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*w2r*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*k**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*w3i**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*cs**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhogeq*2^*sai**2^*rhoge$ $w3r*^4rhogeq*w2i*rhogeq*w2i*rhogeq*w2i*rhogeq*w2i*rhogeq*w2i*w3r*rhogeq*w2r*w3r*rhogeq*w2r*r$ w3r*w3i**2*Kdrag**2*k*vgsol + w3r*w3i**2*Kdrag**2*k*vdsol - w3r*rhogeq**2*w1i**2*k*vgsol*w3i**2 - 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*w3i**2*k*w2i*w1i*vgsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*w2i*w1i**2*w3i*k*vgsol + w3r*w3i**2*Kdrag*rhogsol*w1i*w2r + w3r*Kdrag*rhogsol*w2i*w1r - w3r*Kdrag*rhogsol*k**2*cs**2*w1i*w2r - w3r*Kdrag*rhogsol*k**2*cs**2*w1i*w2r + w3r*Kdrag*rhogsol*w2i*w1r + w3r $w3r^{K}drag^{**}2^{k}vgsol^{*w2i}w1i^{**}2 + w3r^{K}drag^{**}2^{k}vdsol^{*w2r}w1r - w3r^{K}drag^{**}2^{k}vdsol^{*w2i}w1i - w3r^{K}drag^{**}2^{k}vgsol^{*w2i}w1i + w3r^{K}drag^{**}2^{k}vgsol^{*}w1i + w3r^{K}drag^{*}2^{k}vgsol^{*}w1i + w3r^{K}drag^{*}2^{k}wsgsol^{*}w1i + w3$ $w3r^{k}drag^{k}rhogeq^{w}2i^{*}2^{*}w3i^{*}2^{k}wgsol - 2^{*}w3r^{r}hogeq^{*}2^{*}w2r^{*}2^{*}w3i^{*}2^{k}wgsol + w3r^{r}hogeq^{*}2^{*}w3i^{*}2^{k}wgsol + w3r^{r}hogeq^{*}2^{*}wgsol + w3r^$ w3r*rhogeq*w2r**2*w3i**2*w1i*k*vgsol - 2*w3r*rhogeq*w1i*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vgsol + w3r*rhogeq*w1i*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*w3i*w2r**2*w1i*k*vgsol + w3r*rhogeq*w1i*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vgsol + w3r*rhogeq*w1i*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*w3i*w2r**2*w1i*k*vgsol + w3r*rhogeq*w1i*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vgsol + w3r*rhogeq*w1i*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vgsol + w3r*rhogeq*w1i*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*w3i*w2r**2*w1i*k*vgsol + w3r*rhogeq*w1i*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vgsol + w3r*rhogeq*w1i*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*w3i*w2r**2*w1i*k*vgsol + w3r*rhogeq*w1i*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*w3i*w2r**2*w1i*k*vgsol + w3r*rhogeq**1*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*w3i***2*w1i*k*vgsol + w3r*rhogeq**1*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*w3i**2*k*Kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*k*kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*k*vgsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*k*kdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**1*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq***2*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhogeq**2*kkdrag*vdsol + 2*w3r*rhw3r*rhogeq*2*w3i*2*w2i*2*k*2gsol - w3r*rhogeq*cs*2*k*2*w1i*2*w2r*rhogsol - w3r*rhogeq*cs*2*k*2*w2r*w1r*2*rhogsol - w3r*rhogeq*cs*2*k*2*w1r*rhogsol + w3r*rhogeq*cs*2*k*2*w1r*rw3r*rhogeq*w2r*w3i*2*w1r*2*rhogsol - 2*w3r*rhogeq*2*cs*2*k*3*w3i*w2i*vgsol - w3r*rhogeq*w2i*2*w1r*cs*2*k*3*w3i*w2i*2*k*3*w3i*w2i*v2i*2*k*3*w3i*w2i*2*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*2*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*2*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w3i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w2i*k*3*w3i*w3i*w2i* $2^*w3r^{hogeq^{*2}cs^{*2}k^{*3}w2i^{w1i^{*}w2i^{*2}-w3i^{*}rhogeq^{*}rhogsol^{k^{*2}cs^{*2}w1i} - w3r^{**2}w3i^{*}rhogeq^{*}rhogsol^{w2i^{*}2} - w3r^{**2}w3i^{*}rhogeq^{*}rhogsol^{k^{*2}cs^{*}2^{*}w1i} - w3r^{*}rhogeq^{*}rhogsol^{k^{*2}cs^{*}2^{*}w1i} - w3r^{*}rhogeq^{*}rhogsol^{k^{*2}cs^{*}2^{*}w1i} - w3r^{*}rhogeq^{*}rhogsol^{k^{*2}cs^{*}2^{*}w1i} - w3r^{*}rhogeq^{*}rhogsol^{k^{*}cs^{*}2^{*}w1i} - w3r^{*}rhogeq^{*}rho$ $w3r^{*2}w3i^{rhogsol^{*}w2i}w1i^{*2} - w3r^{*2}w3i^{rhogsol^{*}w2i}w1i^{*2} - w3r^{*2}w3i^{rhogsol^{*}w2i}w1i - w3r^{*2}w3i^{rhogsol^{*}w2i}$ $w3r*2^*w3i^*rhogsol^*k*2^*cs*2^*w2i - w3r*2^*Kdrag^*rhogsol^*k*2^*cs*2^*w3i + w3r*2^*Kdrag^*rhogsol^*k*2^*cs*2^*w2i + w3r*2^*kdrag^*rhogsol^*ka*2^*cs*2^*w2i + w3r*2^*kdrag^*rhogsol^*ka*2^*cs*2^*w2i + w3r*2^*kdrag^*rhogsol^*ka*2^*cs*2^*w2i + w3r*2^*kdrag^*rhogsol^*ka*2^*cs*2^*w2i + w3r*2^*kdrag^*rhogsol^*ka*2^*cs*2^*w2i + w3r*2^*kdrag^*rhogsol^*ka*2^*cs*2^*w2i + w3r*2^*kdrag^*rhogsol^*ka*2^*cs*2^*ka*2^*cs*2^*ka*2^*cs*2^*ka*2^*cs*2^*ka*2^*cs*2^*ka*2^*cs*2^*ka*2^*cs*2^*ka*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*2^*cs*$ $2^{*}w3r^{*}2^{*}Kdrag^{*}k^{*}hogeq^{*}vgsol^{*}w3i^{*}u1r + 2^{*}w3r^{*}2^{*}rhogeq^{**}2^{*}w2r^{*}k^{*}vgsol^{*}w3i^{*}2 - w3r^{**}2^{*}rhogeq^{**}2^{*}cs^{*}2^{*}k^{*}3^{*}w2r^{*}vgsol + w3r^{*}2^{*}rhogeq^{**}2^{*}w2r^{*}w1i^{*}k^{*}Kdrag^{*}vgsol + w3r^{*}2^{*}rhogeq^{**}2^{*}w2r^{*}w1i^{*}2^{*}k^{*}vgsol + w3r^{*}2^{*}rhogeq^{**}2^{*}w2r^{*}k^{*}vgsol^{*}k^{*}vgsol + w3r^{*}2^{*}rhogeq^{**}2^{*}w2r^{*}k^{*}vgsol^{*}vgsol^{*}k^{*}vgsol^{*}k^{*}vgsol^{*}vgsol^{*}vgsol^{*}k^{*}vgsol^{*}v$ w3r**2*rhogeq*w2r*w1i*k*Kdrag*vdsol + w3r**2*rhogeq**2*w2r*w1r**2*k*vgsol - w3r**2*rhogeq**2*cs**2*k**3*w1r*vgsol - w3r**2*Kdrag**2*k*vdsol*w2r - w3r**2*rhogeq*w2i**2*w1i**2*rhogsol $w3r^{*2}rhogeq^{*}w1r^{*2}w2i^{*2}rhogeq^{*}w2r^{*2}rhogeq^{*}w2r^{*2}rhogeq^{*}w2r^{*2}rhogeq^{*}w1r^{*}w1r$ $w3r^{**2*}Kdrag^{*rhogsol^{*}w2i^{*}u1r^{**2}} - w3r^{**2*}Kdrag^{*rhogsol^{*}w2i^{*}u1i^{**2}} - w3r^{**2*}Kdrag^{*rhogsol^{*}w2r^{**2}}Kdrag^{**2*}Kdrag^{**2}Kdrag^{**2}Kdrag^{**2*}Kdrag^{**2*}Kdrag^{**2}Kdrag^$ $w3r**3^{K}drag^{rhogsol} + w3r**2^{rhogeq} + w3r**3^{rhogeq} + w3r**3^{rhogeq} + w3r**3^{rhogeq} + w3r**2^{rhogeq} + w$ 2*w3r**2*rhogeq**2*w3i**2*k*w1r*vgsol + 2*w3r**2*rhogeq*w1i*w3i**2*rhogeq*w2i*w1r*k*Kdrag*vdsol + w3r**2*rhogeq*w2i*w1r*k*Kdrag*vdsol + w3r**2*rhogeq*w1r*k*Kdrag*vdsol + w3r**2*rhogeq*w1r*k*Kdrag*vdsol + w3r**2*rhogeq*w1r*k***Kdrag*vdsol + w3r**2*rhogeq*w1r*k*****kdrag*vdsol + w3r**2*rhogeq*w1r*k*********w1r*k***kdrag*vdsol + w3r**2*rhogeq*w1r*k************************* $2^{*}w3r^{*}3^{*}rhogeq^{*}2^{*}w2r^{*}k^{*}w1r^{*}vgsol + w3r^{*}3^{*}rhogeq^{*}w2r^{*}2^{*}w1r^{*}rhogeq^{*}w2r^{*}s^{*}rhogeq^{*}rhogeq^{*}w2r^{*}s^{*}rhogeq^{*}rhogeq^{*}rhogeq^{*}w2r^{*}s^{*}rhogeq^{*}rh$ w3r**3*rhogeq*w1r*cs**2*k**2rhogsol - w3r**3*rhogeq**2*w2r**2*k*vgsol + w3r**3*rhogeq*w1i*k*Kdrag*vdsol - 2*w3r**3*rhogeq**2*k*w2i*w1i*vgsol + w3r**3*rhogeq**2*k*vgsol + w3r**3*rhogw3r**3*rhogeq*w1i**2*w2r*rhogsol + w3r**3*rhogeq*w2i**2*w1r*rhogsol - 2*w3r**3*rhogeq*w1i*k*Kdrag*vgsol + w3r**3*Kdrag*rhogsol*w1i*w2r + w3r**2*rhogeq**2*w2r**2*k*w1r*vgsol -2*w3r**2*rhogeq*w3i**2*cs**2*k**2*rhogsol + w3r**3*Kdrag**2*k*vdsol + w3i**2*rhogeq**2*cs**2*k**3*w2r*vgsol - w3r**3*Kdrag**2*k*vgsol + w3i**2*rhogeq*w2i*w1r*k*Kdrag*vdsol - w3i**2*Kdrag**2*k*vdsol*w2r + w3i**2*Kdrag**2*K*vgsol*w2r - w3i**2*Kdrag*rhogsol*w2r**2*w1i - w3i**2*Kdrag*rhogsol*w1i*w2i**2 - w3i**2*Kdrag*rhogsol*w2i*w1r**2 - w3i**2*Kdrag*rhogsol*w2i*w1i**2 + w3i**2*Kdrag*rhogsol*w2i**2*w2i + w3i**2*Kdrag*rhogsol*k**2*cs**2*w1i - Kdrag*k*rhogeq*vgsol*w3i*w1r*w2r**2 - Kdrag*k*rhogeq*vgsol*w3i*w2r*w1i**2 - Kdrag*k*rhogeq*vgsol*w3i*w1r*w2i**2 + $Kdrag^{*}rhogsol^{*}k^{*2}cs^{*2}w3i^{*}w2r^{*}v1r - Kdrag^{*}rhogsol^{*}k^{*2}cs^{*2}w2i^{*}w3i^{*}w1i + Kdrag^{*}rhogsol^{*}w2r^{**2}w3i + Kdrag^{*}rhogsol^{*}w3i^{*}w2r^{**2} + Kdrag^{*}rhogsol^{*}w1i^{**2}w2i^{*}w3i + Kdrag^{*}rhogsol^{*}w1i^{**2}w2i^{*}w3i + Kdrag^{*}rhogsol^{*}w1i^{*}w1r^{*}w2r$ $Kdrag^{*rhogsol^{*}2^{*}k^{2}w3i + Kdrag^{**2^{*}k^{2}w3i + Kdrag^{**2^{*}k^{2}w3i + Kdrag^{**2^{*}k^{2}w3i^{*}w1r - Kdrag^{**2^{*}k^{*}w1r - Kdrag^{**2^{*}k^{*}w1r - Kdrag^{**2^{*}k^{*}w1r - Kdrag^{*}w1r - Kdr$ $rhogeq^*cs^{**2}*k^{*3}*w2i^*w1r^*Kdrag^*vdsol - rhogeq^*cs^{**2}*k^{**3}*w2i^*w1r^*Kdrag^*vgsol - w3i^{**2}rhogeq^{**2}*w1r^*k^*vgsol - w3i^{**2}rhogeq^{**2}*w2r^{**2}k^*w1r^*vgsol - w3i^{**2}rhogeq^{**2}w2r^{**2}k^{**3}w2r^{**2}k^{**3}w2r^{**2}rhogeq^{**2}w2r^{**2}k^{**3}w2r^{**2}k^{**3}w2r^{**2}rhogeq^{**2}w2r^{**2}k^{**3}w2r^{**2}k^{**3}w2r^{**2}rhogeq^{**2}w2r^{**2}k^{**3}w2r^{**2}rhogeq^{**2}rhogeq^{**2}w2r^{**2}k^{**3}w2r^{**2}rhogeq^{**$ w3i**2*rhogeq*w2r*w1i*k*Kdrag*vgsol - w3i**2*rhogeq**2*w2r*w1i**2*rhogeq**2*w2r*w1i*k*Kdrag*vdsol - w3i**2*rhogeq**2*w2r*w1r**2*rhogeq**2*w2r*w1i*k*Kdrag*vdsol - w3i**2*rhogeq**2*w2r*w1r**2*rhogeq**2*w2r*w1i*k*Kdrag*vdsol - w3i**2*rhogeq**2*w2r*w1i*k*Kdrag*vdsol - w3i**2*rhogeq***w3i**2*rhogeq*w2i**2*w1i**2*rhogeq*w1i**2*rhogeq*w1i**2*rhogeq*w1r**2*rhogeq*w2r**2*rhogeq*w2r**2*rhogeq*w2r**2*rhogeq*w1r**2*rhogeq*w1i****2*rhogeq*w1i**2*rhogeq*w1i** $w3r^{*2} + w1r^{**2} + w3i^{**2} - 2^{*}w3r^{*}w1r)/(w2r^{**2} - 2^{*}w3r^{*}w2r + w2i^{**2} + w3i^{**2} - 2^{*}w2i^{*}w3i + w3r^{**2})/k/rhogeq/Kdrag$

RESOLUTION STUDY

Laibe & Price, 2012, MNRAS 420, 2345



Figure 8. Resolution study for the DUSTYWAVE test in 1D using a high drag coefficient (K = 100) and a dust-to-gas ratio of unity using 32, 64, 128, 256, 512 and 1024 particles from bottom to top. At large drag high resolution is required to resolve the small differential motions between the fluids and thus prevent over-damping of the numerical solution, corresponding to the criterion $h \leq c_s t_s$, here implying $\gtrsim 240$ particles. See also Fig. 9.



DUSTYSHOCK

Laibe & Price, 2012, MNRAS 420, 2345



RESOLUTION CRITERION

Laibe & Price, 2012, MNRAS 420, 2345

Temporal:

 $\Delta t < t_{\rm stop}$

(can be fixed with implicit timestepping methods)

Spatial:

 $\Delta x \lesssim t_{\rm stop} c_{\rm s}$

(cannot be fixed)

$$t_{\text{stop}} \to 0 \quad \text{implies} \quad \begin{array}{l} \Delta t \to 0 \\ \Delta x \to 0 \end{array}$$

 Require infinite timesteps AND infinite resolution in the obvious limit of perfect coupling!

DUSTYDISC



 Problems when the dust is concentrated below the resolution of the gas

 Need to ensure that h_gas <
 h_dust at all times

Laibe & Price (2012a,b)

SAME ISSUE WITH GRIDS + DUST PARTICLES



Price & Federrath (2010)

SO WE ARE STUFFED

- Can't use same formulation to solve both small grains (strong coupling) and large grains (weak coupling).
 Need a better approach to the strong coupling regime.
- Two fluid approach always ends up in trouble when dust collapses/condenses below resolution of the gas.
- Without analytic solutions, none of this would be obvious

DUSTY GAS WITH ONE FLUID?

 Reformulate equations on the barycentre of both fluids

$$\mathbf{v} \equiv \frac{\rho_{\rm g} \mathbf{v}_{\rm g} + \rho_{\rm d} \mathbf{v}_{\rm d}}{\rho_{\rm g} + \rho_{\rm d}}$$

• Change of variables, from $\mathbf{v}_{g}, \mathbf{v}_{d}, \rho_{g}, \rho_{d}$

to $\mathbf{v}, \Delta \mathbf{v}, \rho, \rho_{\rm d}/\rho_{\rm g}$

TWO BECOME ONE

A phoenix from the ashes

Two fluids coupled by a drag term

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \rho_{\rm g}}{\partial t} + \nabla . \left(\rho_{\rm g} \mathbf{v}_{\rm g} \right) &= 0, \\ \frac{\partial \rho_{\rm d}}{\partial t} + \nabla . \left(\rho_{\rm d} \mathbf{v}_{\rm d} \right) &= 0, \\ \frac{\partial \mathbf{v}_{\rm g}}{\partial t} + \left(\mathbf{v}_{\rm g} . \nabla \right) \mathbf{v}_{\rm g} &= -\frac{\nabla P_{\rm g}}{\rho_{\rm g}} + K(\mathbf{v}_{\rm d} - \mathbf{v}_{\rm g}) + \mathbf{f}, \\ \frac{\partial \mathbf{v}_{\rm d}}{\partial t} + \left(\mathbf{v}_{\rm d} . \nabla \right) \mathbf{v}_{\rm d} &= -K(\mathbf{v}_{\rm d} - \mathbf{v}_{\rm g}) + \mathbf{f}, \end{aligned}$$

TWO BECOME ONE

A phoenix from the ashes

One mixture with decay of differential velocity

 $\begin{aligned} \frac{\mathrm{d}\rho}{\mathrm{d}t} &= -\rho(\nabla \mathbf{.v}), \\ \frac{\mathrm{d}\mathbf{v}}{\mathrm{d}t} &= \mathbf{f} - \frac{\nabla P_{\mathrm{g}}}{\rho} - \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \left(\frac{\rho_{\mathrm{g}}\rho_{\mathrm{d}}}{\rho} \Delta \mathbf{v}^{2}\right), \\ \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left(\frac{\rho_{\mathrm{d}}}{\rho_{\mathrm{g}}}\right) &= -\frac{\rho}{\rho_{\mathrm{g}}^{2}} \nabla \cdot \left(\frac{\rho_{\mathrm{g}}\rho_{\mathrm{d}}}{\rho} \Delta \mathbf{v}\right), \\ \frac{\mathrm{d}\Delta\mathbf{v}}{\mathrm{d}t} &= -\frac{\Delta\mathbf{v}}{t_{\mathrm{s}}} + \frac{\nabla P_{\mathrm{g}}}{\rho_{\mathrm{g}}} - (\Delta\mathbf{v}\cdot\nabla)\mathbf{v} + \frac{1}{2} \nabla \left(\frac{\rho_{\mathrm{d}} - \rho_{\mathrm{g}}}{\rho_{\mathrm{d}} + \rho_{\mathrm{g}}} \Delta \mathbf{v}^{2}\right). \end{aligned}$

Laibe & Price (2013, submitted to MNRAS)

WHAT DOES THIS SOLVE?

- Only one resolution length
- Mixture described by evolution of gas-to-dust ratio
- Only minor extension to usual fluid equations
- Strong drag limit is trivial!
- Completely general: can simulate both weak and strong coupling (small and large grains) with same formulation*

* if no counter-streaming

STRONG DRAG/SMALL GRAINS





DUSTY WAVES: ONE FLUID



DUSTYSHOCK WITH ONE FLUID



CONCLUSION

WHAT DRAG HAS JOINED TOGETHER, LET MAN NOT SEPARATE